Vol. 11 No. 2 (2024): 71-86

e-ISSN: <u>2477-0280</u>

DOI:10.24952/ multidisipliner.v11i12.12533

# **Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey**

#### Rosvidah AN\*

Institut Agama Islam Al-Qur'an dan Al-Ittifaqiah, Indonesia e-mail: <a href="mailto:rosyidahnaufa143@gmail.com">rosyidahnaufa143@gmail.com</a>

#### Komarudin Sassi

Institut Agama Islam Al-Qur'an dan Al-Ittifaqiah, Indonesia

e-mail: <a href="mailto:sassikomarudin@yahoo.com">sassikomarudin@yahoo.com</a>

# Ibnu Imam Al Ayyubi

Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Darul Falah, Indonesia e-mail: <a href="mailto:ibnuimam996@staidaf.ac.id">ibnuimam996@staidaf.ac.id</a>

#### Abstract

This article discusses the differences in the education systems in Germany and Turkey. In addition, this article will discuss educational management, curriculum, materials, and assessment systems in educational institutions. The purpose of this study is to find out what are the differences in the education system in Germany and Turkey. In addition, this article will discuss educational management, curriculum, materials, and assessment systems in Educational institutions. In this study, a qualitative descriptive analytical method is used. The two sources of research materials are primary and secondary data. Primary data is textbooks, and secondary data consists of government regulations, scientific publications, journals, and other relevant articles. with current studies. Data analysis techniques include data reduction, data transmission, and conclusion drawing. The result of this study is that education in Turkey and Germany has many significant differences. The following are some of the key differences: The structure of education in Turkey is as follows, primary education lasts 8 years, secondary education lasts 4 years. Higher education in Germany includes bachelor's, master's, and doctoral programs. Here are the differences in the education system between schools in Germany and Turkey.

Keywords: Comparation; Education System; Management

# Abstrak

Artikel ini membahas perbedaan sistem pendidikan di Jerman dan Turki. Selain itu, artikel ini akan membahas manajemen pendidikan, kurikulum, materi, dan sistem penilaian pada lembaga pendidikan. Adapun tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk mengetahui apa saja perbedaan-perbedaan sistem pendidikan di Jerman dan Turki. Selain itu, artikel ini akan membahas manajemen pendidikan, kurikulum, materi, dan sistem penilaian pada lembaga Pendidikan. Dalam penelitian ini menggunakan metode kualitatif deskriptif analitis. Dua sumber bahan penelitian adalah data primer dan sekunder. Data primer adalah buku teks, dan data sekunder terdiri dari peraturan pemerintah, publikasi ilmiah, jurnal, dan artikel lainnya yang relevan. dengan studi saat ini. Teknis analisis data mencakup pengurangan data, pengiriman data, dan penarikan kesimpulan. Hasil penelitian ini adalah Pendidikan di Turki dan Jerman memiliki banyak perbedaan yang signifikan. Berikut ini adalah beberapa perbedaan utama: Struktur pendidikan di Turki adalah sebagai berikut, pendidikan dasar berlangsung 8 tahun, pendidikan menengah 4 tahun. Pendidikan tinggi di Jerman mencakup program sarjana, magister, dan doktoral. Berikut perbedaan sistem pendidikan antara sekolah-sekolah di Jerman dan Turki.

Kata Kunci: Perbandingan; Sistem Pendidikan; Manajemen

#### INTRODUCTION

Education is a conscious and planned effort to create an environment and learning process in which students actively develop their potential to have the religious spiritual strength, selfcontrol, personality, intelligence, noble character, and skills necessary for them, for their society,

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

nation, and country. Furthermore, education is a means that can unite every citizen of the nation. 2 Aware of the importance of education, human beings have created an education system that is considered to be a must exist in national and international life, adaptation to the unique characteristics of each society, which are usually associated with values, rituals, models, and symbols. However, the results achieved vary based on the economic, social, and cultural differences of communities around the world, as well as political conditions. Therefore, in many places, the study of educational programs and the tools used by society to achieve high goals is increasingly of scientific concern. Perhaps the main feature of comparative educational studies today is the desire to learn as much as possible about all educational activities.

Turkey, a large country with a long history, is one of the most important places in the history of Islamic development.3 In addition, Turkey is a representation of two Western and Islamic cultures among Asian and European civilizations.<sup>4</sup> Over time, Turkey has had a significant influence on the Islamic world with its unique civilization. Now turn to German revenue. With an area of 356,957 km<sup>2</sup>, Germany is located in the middle of continental Europe. More than 82 million people live in Germany, and about 8% of them are foreigners who arrive there. As a strong exporting country, Germany faces significant international trade challenges, which have an impact on education. The same thing is happening in Germany, where the trade and service sectors are undergoing a very rapid transformation of society. In addition, funds have continued to flow into the country formerly known as the German Democratic Republic since 1990. This fund finances infrastructure repairs, reconstruction, and efforts to combat unemployment. This poses a significant burden on the state budget and clearly endangers the state education budget.

Comparative studies of education take a long time because the education system in each country is very complex and connected to various other systems.<sup>5</sup> Especially those related to

| 72

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Haukur Ingi Jonasson dan Helgi Thor Ingason, "Using altruism in project management education: How 'Doing Good' impacts student motivation," Project Leadership and Society 3 (2022): 100038, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.plas.2021.100038.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Aunurrahman Aunurrahman, "Implementation of Character Education in Building School Culture," *Jurnal* Visi Ilmu Pendidikan 13, no. 1 (2021): 11, https://doi.org/10.26418/jvip.v13i1.44565; Hussain A Almalky dan Abdullah A Alwahbi, "Teachers' perceptions of their experience with inclusive education practices in Saudi Arabia," Research in Developmental Disabilities 140 (2023): 104584, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ridd.2023.104584; Ainin Najah, Imam Syafe'i, dan Amiruddin Amiruddin, "Implications of Learning in Islamic Religious Education in Forming Students' Attitudes of Religious Tolerance," Al-Fikru: Jurnal Ilmiah 16, no. 2 (2022): 306-13, https://doi.org/10.51672/alfikru.v16i2.136; Stephen P Heyneman, "Comparative and international education in my experience: 1970-2022," International Journal of Educational Development 103 (2023): 102912, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2023.102912.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Ahmet Yıldız, "Examining gifted primary school students' logical reasoning ability," *Turkish Journal of* Educational Studies 9, no. 1 (2022): 85-100, https://doi.org/10.33907/turkjes.892597.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Azlisham Abdul Aziz, "Analysis Of Literature Review On Spiritual Concepts According To The Perspectives Of The Al-Quran, Hadith And Islamic Scholars," Turkish Journal of Computer and Mathematics Education (TURCOMAT) 12, no. 9 (2021): 3152-59.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Imron Muttagin, "Brand Personality Dimension for Islamic Educational Institution," *Indonesian Journal of* Islamic Education Studies (IJIES) 6, no. 1 (2023): 33-49, https://doi.org/10.33367/ijies.v6i1.3757; Friedrich Schweitzer, "Comparative research in religious education: International-interdenominational-interreligious," Towards a European perspective on religious education, 2004; Nazid Zaki Fuadi dan Muhammad Wildan Shohib, "The Teaching of Islamic Education in the Multicultural School Environment: Approaches and Challenges," Jurnal PAI Raden Fatah 6, no. 1 (2024): 76-88, https://doi.org/10.19109/pairf.v6i1.19822; Alex Sander Clemente de Souza dan Luciana Debs, "Concepts, innovative technologies, learning approaches and trend topics in education 4.0: A literature review," Social Sciences & Humanities 0pen (2024): https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2024.100902; Hamlan Andi Baso Malla dkk., "The Application of Multicultural

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

politics, economics, geography, and so on.<sup>6</sup> One of the reasons why we have to compare education is because education is one of the drivers of social capital in society. Although education is not the only way, it is recognized to have a significant impact in building a society that is able to compete with other companies.<sup>7</sup> There may be some who argue that comparative education studies are still focused on the field of higher education, but the current reality on the ground shows that comparative education studies have been conducted outside of universities, even in autonomous specialized research institutions.<sup>8</sup> In fact, there are still universities that still have a small role in the development of comparative education.

Previous studies of comparative education systems in Germany and Turkey have revealed important aspects that reflect the differences and similarities in the educational approaches of the two countries. The research of Thomas Deissinger highlights the German education system which is famous for its dual system approach, namely the integration of academic education and vocational training. This system is supported by the decentralization of education policies that allow state governments to manage the curriculum according to local needs. In addition, the focus on vocational education has successfully prepared students to enter the job market with relevant practical skills. However, challenges remain, especially regarding social disparities that affect access to education for students from immigrant backgrounds. Meanwhile, the study of Erdem Aksoy discusses the education system in Turkey which has grown rapidly since the Republic era, emphasizing the importance of basic education as the main foundation. The educational reform carried out aims to increase student participation at the secondary and tertiary levels. However, the main challenges faced are the inequality between rural and urban areas, as well as the influence

Education Values in Islamic Religious Learning at Karuna High School DIPA Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia," *International Journal of Social Science and Human Research* 5, no. 06 (2022): 2309–15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Mohammad Ammar, Noora J Al-Thani, dan Zubair Ahmad, "Role of pedagogical approaches in fostering innovation among K-12 students in STEM education," *Social Sciences & Humanities Open* 9 (2024): 100839, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2024.100839.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Reni Sasmita, "Character Education Metod From the Lens of Al-Ghazali on Generation Z," *EDUSOSHUM*: of Islamic Education and Social Humanities 2, no. (2022): https://doi.org/10.52366/edusoshum.v2i3.47; Robina Shaheen, "Creativity and Education," Creative Education 01 (Januari 2010): 166-69, https://doi.org/10.4236/ce.2010.13026; Muhaemin Muhaemin dkk., "Religious moderation in Islamic religious education as a response to intolerance attitudes in Indonesian educational institutions," Journal of Social Studies Education Research 14, no. 2 (2023): 253-74; Agung Pambudi Nugroho dkk., "Renewable energy education and awareness among Indonesian students: Exploring challenges and opportunities for a sustainable future," Sustainable Energy Technologies and Assessments 63 (2024): 103631, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seta.2024.103631; Moh Padil, Fatimah Saguni, dan Adawiyah Adawiyah, "Islamic Education Teachers Strategy in Implementing Multiculturalism Based Education," International Journal of Contemporary Islamic Education 3, no. 2 (2021): 78-94, https://doi.org/10.24239/ijcied.Vol3.Iss2.40; Sarifa Suhra dkk., "The Urgency of Cooperative Learning in the Implementation of the 2013 Curriculum on Islamic Religious Education Subjects at SMA Negeri 1 Watampone," PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology 18, no. 10 (2021): 36-45; Suherman Suherman, "Character education in the family as a strengthening of moderation during era," Iournal of Social Studies (ISS) 18, no. (2022): https://doi.org/10.21831/jss.v18i2.53229; Muhammad Mirza Firdaus, "Challenges and Opportunities of Higher Education Based on Islamic Boarding Schools," dalam Indonesian Proceedings and Annual Conference of Islamic Education (IPACIE), vol. 1, 2022, 437-44.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Mark Brundrett dkk., Contemporary Issues in Primary Education, vol. 1010 (London: Routledge, 2022).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Thomas Deissinger dan Philipp Gonon, "The Development and Cultural Foundations of Dual Apprenticeships – a Comparison of Germany and Switzerland," *Journal of Vocational Education & Training* 73, no. 2 (3 April 2021): 197–216, https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2020.1863451.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Erdem Aksoy, "2023 Vision for Education in Turkey in the Shadow of 1968 Curriculum," *Educational Studies* 50, no. 4 (3 Juli 2024): 480–98, https://doi.org/10.1080/03055698.2021.1956087.

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

of ideology seen in the national curriculum. This creates a complex dynamic in the implementation of education policy in Turkey.

A comparative study conducted by Manolya Demir compared the institutional structure and curriculum approach in Germany and Turkey. The study shows that Germany emphasizes vocational education with a specialization orientation, while Turkey focuses on nationally standardized formal education. Access to education in Germany tends to be more inclusive, especially for minority groups, while Turkey faces challenges in ensuring equitable distribution of education across the region, especially in remote areas. 11 Another study by Diana Spulber highlights the influence of socio-cultural factors on education policies in both countries. In Germany, cultural diversity encourages the development of multicultural educational programs to support the integration of immigrant students.<sup>12</sup> In contrast, in Turkey, religious issues and nationalism are often the dominant factors in curriculum development, which sometimes creates tensions in a pluralistic society. In addition, Hanushek research examines the implications of the education system on the labor market. The results show that the vocational education approach in Germany contributes significantly to the low unemployment rate.<sup>13</sup> On the other hand, education in Turkey, although showing an improvement in terms of accessibility, still needs to strengthen the relationship between formal education and the needs of the labor market to improve the competitiveness of graduates.

Undoubtedly, there are many benefits that can be obtained from the process of comparing education between countries, one of which is that countries whose education systems are not yet developed can learn from other countries whose education systems are already advanced. One example is the adaptation of the education standard model in other countries, which has a major impact on countries that are mostly inhabited by Muslims, and makes the education system better, both in terms of quality and quantity. However, there are many Islamic countries where education is still low. Many countries in the Middle East have decided to adopt the Western education model as a way to improve their education systems. As a result, the education system in these countries has recently progressed and has proven to be of better quality.

# **RESEARCH METHOD**

This research uses a descriptive approach, which aims to describe, explain, and describe a case or phenomenon systematically. This approach allows researchers to present a comprehensive picture of the object being studied based on the data collected. This study specifically analyzes qualitative data, which is a research approach that uses various philosophical assumptions, as well as data collection, analysis, and interpretation methods to understand phenomena in depth. The qualitative approach is unique in the data analysis process that prioritizes text, images, or documents as the main source of information. This allows for exploration of the context and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Sebnem Manolya Demir dkk., "No Country for Young Refugees: Barriers and Opportunities for Inclusive Refugee Education Practices," *Production and Operations Management*, 16 April 2024, 10591478241243382, https://doi.org/10.1177/10591478241243382.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Diana Spulber dan Marja Nesterova, "Intercultural Education and Social Innovation Approaches as Answers to Societal Challenges of Migration," *Geopolitical, Social Security and Freedom Journal* 6, no. 1–2 (1 Desember 2023): 20–37, https://doi.org/10.2478/gssfj-2023-0002.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Eric A. Hanushek dkk., "General education, vocational education, and labor-market outcomes over the lifecycle," *Journal of human resources* 52, no. 1 (2017): 48–87, https://jhr.uwpress.org/content/52/1/48.short.

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

meaning behind the data, which is often difficult to reach through a quantitative approach. One of the data collection methods used in this study is a literature study.<sup>14</sup> This method involves reviewing literature sources such as books, journals, magazines, and online news that are relevant to the research topic. In addition, literature studies also allow researchers to get a broader perspective by examining various views or results of previous research. This method is not only useful for gathering structured information, but also helps researchers to identify important patterns or themes in the analyzed data. Thus, the descriptive and qualitative approaches applied in this study provide a strong foundation for understanding the phenomenon comprehensively, both in terms of theory and practice.

#### RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

#### **Education System in Germany**

Since the 17th century, Germany has managed to develop its education system and handed over the primary responsibility of regulating education. This sparked disputes between the state, the church, and the states because each considered having the authorization to develop and regulate education independently. After losing two world wars, the community learned to change the paradigm in building its education system. They want to avoid the same mistake of separating themselves from political power and not leaving it to just one institution or individual. Hitler's unwavering power had brought Germany into chaos, especially its National education system. In managing Education, the state is given the authority to manage education, regulations are enacted that give people the freedom to choose the school they want, the job that suits their skills, and the vocational education that suits their wishes. Education is usually administered by states and federations; The state is responsible for building public elementary schools and vocational schools.

The following are some of the unique policies of the German education system: First, education is a key pillar of building civilization, and the German government seeks to ensure that every citizen has equal rights and proper access to education. To support this policy, the country's government waives education fees from kindergarten to tertiary levels. Second, the absolute authority to manage the education system is not owned by a single government (monopoly), but is shared between the state and federal governments. Third, because of active community involvement. Fourth, the unification of West Germany and East Germany made them realize that there were significant differences in some regions, especially in the East German region. Therefore, the government immediately acted to compensate for it by providing a proportionately allocated budget. Equitable distribution of education quality in each region is a carefully evaluated policy to prevent retention and problems in the future. Fifth, determining the qualifications of teaching staff (teachers), that being a teacher in Germany is not just a side job because the government pays great attention to expertise in teaching fields of study. As a result, the teacher selection process is as difficult as becoming a doctor, and the government guarantees the welfare of teachers, especially in the financial field.<sup>15</sup>

#### **Politics and Educational Goals**

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Adriani Susanty dkk., *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif* (Malang: CV. Future Science, 2023).

 $<sup>^{15}</sup>$  Schweitzer, "Comparative research in religious education: International-interdenominational-interreligious."

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

The past history of Germany is based on the defeat in the two world wars and the destruction of the country itself. As a result, society began to build an education system that was free from the possibility of making the same mistakes, by separating powers, including in the field of education, so that it was not focused on one person or institution. This was done due to the magnitude of Hitler's influence, which led to the destruction of Germany as a whole. Education aims to instill a strong desire to progress and the skills necessary to restore the country's independence and strength. In addition, the division of Germany for a long time made unity an important issue in German educational culture.

In the beginning, the two major institutions in Germany were the state and the church always influenced education.<sup>17</sup> In addition, the state claims to have the authority to regulate the education system independently. Since compulsory education was enforced in the 17th century, the issue of education began to develop into a state obligation. Since then, federal laws governing education have led to debate at the state level about the goals of education reform to continue. The three-track school system and universities with an economic system were used in the German Federal Republic after the war The governments of social democratic countries usually consider education as a human right by emphasizing educational efforts based on self-initiative, equality, and collective action. On the other hand, the conservative Christian Democratic government wants educational goals and activities to be collective in order to benefit society by preparing qualified graduates.

The Constitution guarantees everyone the right to grow freely and choose schools, vocational schools, and jobs according to their wishes and abilities. The Federal Constitution of Germany divides the powers of education into States and Federations. The state oversees public schools, vocational schools, and kindergartens. The Democratic Republic group is very concerned about education policy and educational goals. More than two-thirds of the National Socialist Party's teachers in 1949 were replaced by new teachers who received short-term education. In this way, adherence to communist standards can be achieved more convincingly. Therefore, Soviet educational standards, including the principle of "polytechnic education" (1958–1959), were established with the official aim of teaching socialist students. The education system is very strict, with strict political control and economic and social planning in accordance with the country's doctrine. German reunification forced East German Länder to adapt its education system to that of West Germany because there was no major ideological foundation and political changes occurred. Therefore, the general educational objectives are set, both in the new Constitution and in the Preamble to the Law on Extraordinary Schools and Universities, with an emphasis on the development of.

#### **Educational Structure**

Education in Germany starts from the preschool stage known as Kindergarten, which lasts from 3-6 years old. This place of education is referred to as "Vorschulische Einrichtungen", which means "Preparation before education". The concept of kindergartens has been widely imitated by other countries since Germany. As a result, in some countries, this level of school is still called by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Amandine Barb, "The new politics of religious education in the United States and Germany," *German Law Journal* 20, no. 7 (2019): 1035–46, https://doi.org/10.1017/glj.2019.73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Gary Anderson, Kathryn Herr, dan Ann Nihlen, "Studying Your Own School: An Educator's Guide to Practitioner Action Research," *Studying Your Own School: An Educator's Guide to Practitioner Action Research*, 2021, 26–28, https://doi.org/10.4135/9781483329574.

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

the German name "Kindergarten". Mostly, kindergartens are run by churches, social institutions, municipalities, and sometimes also by companies and associations. Next is Grundschule or basic education, which begins at the age of 7 to 10 years and is known in Indonesia as SD (Elementary School). Upon completion of this stage, students can proceed to the next level through four types of schools: Hauptschule, Realschule, Gesamtschule, and Gymnasium. Each of these four options has its own criteria: 1. Hauptschule (grades 5–9/10); 2. Realschule (grades 5–10); 3. Gesamtschule (grades 5–13); and 4. Gym (grades 5–13).

To enter the Hauptschule, Realschule, or Gymnasium, one must go through the "Phase Orientierungs". At this point, the student's talents and abilities are examined, and the decision on where they will attend the Hauptschule or Realschule is made. For students who want to work immediately after graduating from school, this is more important. Of course, after completing the studies at the "Berufsfachschule" or "Fachoberschule". University courses are an additional method of study, but there is still a long way to go. For example, you are required to undergo practical work for many years. In German universities, the degrees awarded are almost the same as in Indonesia, but the level is different. A graduate diploma in Germany is equivalent to a master's or master's degree in Indonesia and can directly follow a doctoral program (Ph.D). This means that S1 in Indonesia is basically equivalent to Vordiplom in Germany, but this depends on the equal distribution of titles. Therefore, there are three educational options for Indonesian graduates who want to continue to Germany, namely (1) An Indonesian diploma is considered equivalent to Vordiplom (semester 5). To obtain a Diploma, a person must take all courses from semester 5 until completing the Diplomarbeit (Final writing); (2) Indonesian diploma is considered above semester 5; and (3) Possession of a diploma obtained in Indonesia is considered sufficient to be able to take the Doctoral program directly because you only need to take a few exams that correspond to your degree. Therefore, Indonesian graduates who want to continue their education in Germany have the opportunity to get a direct promotion (S3). If the field of study and curriculum from the S1 level to the promotion level (S3) are not too different, admission will be easier. Fachhochschule and university are two educational options that are highly preferred by students. FH is the right choice for students who want to pursue a career in industry or work immediately, while universities are the right choice for students who want to pursue academia and research and development.

# **Types of Preschool Education**

Institutions that care about the welfare of children in need of care emerged in the 18th and 19th centuries. These organizations began by teaching religion (the Bible). The purpose of this education is to control the various adverse effects produced by industrialization. This preschool education is aimed at children from the age of three and usually does not include reading, writing, or arithmetic lessons for teachers trained through special professional education. In 1989, about 4% of students in West and East Germany were enrolled in institutions that cater to children with disabilities. In addition, in East Germany there is a special school system (Spezialschulen) for children who have special talents in the arts or sports. These children make up about 1% of that age group. Children with disabilities are usually classified based on the natural disability they experience, such as blindness, physical disability, or mental disorders. This category includes the provision of special classes and even exceptional schools. Special education consists of two categories of programs behavioral disorders and learning disabilities.

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

In parallel with vocational, engineering, and business education, the education system that provides qualifications is varied and somewhat complex. Public schools provide professional education, while Chambers of Commerce, Industry, or Finance may award diplomas; This program is known as the "dual system". This diploma or certificate is official and recognized by the state. Fachgymnasium, officially serves as a public high school. The educational program focuses on the economic, social, and technical fields. In general, the professional, technical, and business education systems are organized according to the entry, transition, and graduation requirements. In Germany, there are three general categories of adult education: professional (including technical and financial); and politics. Volchochschulen, which is usually supported by the local community, is a center for adult education programs. Despite the fact that this school can be registered as a nonprofit organization, 1. Language 2. Economics, Mathematics, and Natural Sciences 3. Health 4. Crafts 5. Equivalency School 6. Political and Social Sciences 7. Education, Psychology, and Theology 8. Volkshochschulen Literature and Art is essential for organizing programs because they can be considered professional training for adults. Political education for adults is basically a lesson given by trade unions and activities related to political parties. The program can reach 1% of the population who really need an increase in professional qualifications. It is possible that very few of these activities are formal; in other words, the official recognition of adult education programs as the fourth sector in the German education system is unfounded.

# **Education Management**

The state has the authority to control the education system, according to the German federal constitution. This policy resulted in the state government having full authority to set the policy of the education system. Therefore, state regulations govern the issue of education. German countries today have different education systems, including educational differences. This then prompted Länder to implement national standardization, so that in 1969 the federal government took over part of the country's educational responsibilities. Education financing is supported by the state budget and local community participation. Funding for state employees and infrastructure involving community participation is a component of its distribution. In this case, the federal government is primarily responsible for financing the expansion and facilities necessary for education and research. Because educational institutions do not have to pay students. In fact, both German citizens and foreign students hardly have to pay university fees in Germany. Students only have to pay for the "Sozialgebühren".

Students get many benefits, such as eating at MENSA (student cafeterias on German campuses) at student prices and not having to pay for trains, buses, or trams in some states. The socialgebühren is about 100 euros per semester, which is equivalent to 1,739,693.70 Rupiah. For example, if we eat at MENZA at the University of Bremen at the student rate, it costs only 1,3 euros. However, if we are university employees or external staff, the cost will be 3,5 euros. Three types of tools are used by the ministry of education to compile its curriculum in accordance with applicable laws and regulations. They include tables showing the number of hours of study per week as well as subjects based on "class" and school type, Curricular guidelines, and giving authority to write and obtain textbooks. In general, the educational program in Germany can be described as follows: (1) The general objectives of the curriculum are determined by school regulations or are often

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Barb, "The new politics of religious education in the United States and Germany."

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

written in the premise of the decision, while the specific objectives are specified in the curriculum guidelines; (2) The State Ministry establishes the syllabus, suggested teaching techniques, and model learning plans; and (3) On the other hand, textbooks should not be used without the approval of the Ministry of State, and teachers can use them as long as they are still on the official list of recommended books. The teaching method is not "teacher-centered", but rather "student-centered", or "open education", where students here learn according to their own wishes.

The German school system rarely conducts national assessments of educational outcomes. Internal evaluation refers to a specific type of program evaluation that mostly focuses on research tasks allocated within an organization such as commissions or committees. There is no periodic assessment of national education results. The first survey in the last twenty years based on a sample of student probabilities nationally was the German section of the International Association for Research on the Evaluation of Academic Performance in the Field of "Reading". Compared to other countries, Germany has not conducted empirical research in the field of education significantly. Evaluations, formal exams, are not usually used to measure students' academic achievement. Instead, they are usually used for diagnostic purposes to identify different types of dyslexia—learning disorders caused by certain brain disorders. During the learning process, teachers are fully responsible for student achievement. The findings are presented in the form of written progress reports, where primary education is the main focus. Unofficial tests are conducted with minimal frequency. Student involvement in the classroom becomes more important, and homework assignments can also be used as a means to grade them. The value of the test results is highly dependent on the type of task being measured and the performance of the individual as the procedures vary. Neighboring Jordan also uses a basic code to ensure that lessons are tailored to each student's abilities.<sup>19</sup> The provincial government is responsible for ensuring that the minimum educational requirements are met. This is a process that can be changed. In many countries, after completing high school and junior high school, students receive a recognized certificate. At the university level, final exam assignments are reviewed and approved by the faculty.

# **Education System in Turkey**

Turkey is a united, democratic, and secular constitutional republic. Turkey consists of the Anatolian Peninsula in southwest Asia and the Balkan region in southeastern Europe, Ankara is the capital of Turkey, but Istanbul is the largest city. After the Modern Turkish Republic was established in 1923, the education system was centrally organized according to the direction of Mustafa Kemal Ataturk. Ataturk, as the first president, established a secular state with the aim of creating qualified individuals through education. A productive and innovative class of employees in an era where data is everything. Until now, education has been an arena of philosophical and political conflict between religious conservatives, supported by the military, and secularists, supported by the military. In the end, this became the basis for the Justice and Development Party to take power. Criticized by some quarters, the AKP pushed for change in 2012 by carrying out legal reforms. A four-year extension of compulsory education, one of the planned measures, is considered sufficient. Schools in Turkey are qualitatively performing worse than schools in other

 $<sup>^{19}</sup>$  Arthur E Attema dkk., "The formation of physician altruism," *Journal of Health Economics* 87 (2023): 102716, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhealeco.2022.102716.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Yıldız, "Examining gifted primary school students' logical reasoning ability."

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

OECD member countries. Results from the OECD International Student Assessment Programme (PISA) show that, compared to the OECD average, students in Turkey receive very low scores in literacy, mathematics, and natural sciences.<sup>21</sup> As a result, students in Turkey have experienced a long time to choose their own field of study.

According to data from the Institute of International Education, there were 12,184 Turkish students enrolled in higher education institutions in the United States between 2010 and 2011, including 6,435 graduate students (52%), 3,532 undergraduate students (29%), 1,193 other programs (10%), and 1,024 undergraduate students (8%). In addition, no Turkish students enrolled in the top 10. Due to Germany's strict citizenship regulations, many Turks living there, whether born there or attending school in the German education system, remain Turkish citizens. In 2010, 1,629,000 Turkish citizens lived in Germany. It is estimated that 30,000 to 70,000 people of Turkish citizens acquire German citizenship status each year. In the same year, 26,089 Turks enrolled in German schools. In the 2010-2011 academic year, 31,170 foreign students enrolled in Turkey, which makes it one of the favorite countries of foreign students. This number increased by more than one hundred percent compared to 2005-2006, when only 15,481 foreign students enrolled in Turkish universities. In the academic year 2010-2011, there were more than 18,000. Students from Muslim-majority countries in Turkey. With more than 4,200 students, Azerbaijan is leading the way, followed by Turkmenistan with 4,110 students, and Northern Cyprus with 3,800 students. Bulgaria and Iran are ranked fourth and fifth. In 2011-2012, a total of 1,552 students from 44 African countries studied in Turkey; This is a four-fold increase compared to 2005-2006. Anadolu University in Eskişehir has the largest number of international students, followed by Istanbul University, ODTÜ, Ankara, and Marmara University. In many Turkish universities, the use of English and affordable tuition fees attract foreign students. At least in the last ten years.

# **Educational Structure**

Turkish education consists of several parts: 1. Formal Education, Formal Education is a system of primary, secondary, high, and pre-high schools, which is similar to the education system in Indonesia. 2. Non-formal Education, Non-Formal Education All activities are carried out both inside and outside the school. 3. Pre-School Education, Turkey's Ministry of National Education has many departments, institutions, and institutions involved in preschool education. This includes elementary schools, student homes, and elementary school student enrollment for regular and special classes. Preschool education aims to help students develop emotionally and mentally so that they can make good decisions (ahklak) during primary education. 4. Primary Education, lasting for eight years, and students between the ages of six and fourteen. The educational base includes basic knowledge about children to align physical, mental, and moral development with national educational goals. Public schools replace primary education. The Elementary School is called the "First Primary School" for the first eight years, and the "Second Elementary School" during the twenty-first year.

Students in grades 1 to 3 of primary school are taught mathematics and Turkish. In grades 4 to 6, basic knowledge as well as English language and culture are taught. Some schools teach Spanish, Portuguese, or Hebrew in place of English as a foreign language, while most teach English

 $<sup>^{21}</sup>$  Aziz, "Analysis Of Literature Review On Spiritual Concepts According To The Perspectives Of The Al-Quran, Hadith And Islamic Scholars."

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

as a second language, and some high schools teach two foreign languages at once, according to Kalesan IV, "Basic Knowledge". At the intermediate level, five subjects-math, English, Turkish, Science, and English as a foreign language are offered. In the eighth grade, history and citizenship are replaced with social studies. However, Turkey's education system consists of two parts: 1. Formal Education, or Formal Education: The primary, secondary, high, and pre-high school systems, which are similar to the education system in Indonesia. 2. Non-Formal Education (Non-Formal Education): All activities carried out both inside and outside the school. 5. Secondary Education: After primary education, students must spend a minimum of three years in a technical college (called a lycée). Public high schools and vocational high schools are two categories of high schools. 6. Higher Education (Higher Learning) Turkey's higher education system consists of universities, faculties, institutes, high schools, conservatories, vocational schools, and applied research centers. Higher education serves to provide employees with modern training and education standards that meet the requirements of the country. However, students who have completed high school can also get specific instruction in various subjects in college. Students must have attended a doctoral program for a minimum of four years, completed coursework, passed a qualifying exam, and defended a thesis.

# **Education Management**

Education Management in Turkey is divided into several parts. 1. Authority. Milli Egitim Bakanligi as part of the Ministry of National Education, he is in charge of education, and is led by a minister. 2. Funding. For education, Turkey spent \$13.4 billion in 2002, including the state budget, private funds, and international funds. 3. Curriculum. The curriculum in Turkey consists of several subjects such as Turkish language, Turkish Literature, Mathematics, Physics, Turkish History, Chimestry, Biology, Geometry, Geography, English, Foreign Languages (German, French, Italian, Japanese, Arabic and Russian). At the end of high school, students take a finishing school examination for twelve years, then can continue their studies at university. The Ministry of Education, which was established in 1847, established a new policy to administer education. This Ministry of Education then regulates education in the Ottoman Empire, starting from the establishment of schools to the curriculum. The payload implemented by each educational institution, including additional academic developments, such as university development planning. As a result of the idea of reform for equality between humanity, people of different religions also have equal opportunities in schools. One example is the Galatasaray school, which was founded in 1868, with a curriculum that focuses on general education, an emphasis on the French language, and students of different religions.

During the reign of Sultan Mahmud II, there was also a modernization of education. The general cultural curriculum began to be implemented, and traditional madrassas were no longer relevant, only following the religious curriculum, considering the development of the times and the progress of science in the West. Two public schools were built in an effort to improve general science: Mekteb-I Ma'arif (School of General Knowledge) and Mekteb-I Ulum-u Edebiya (School of Literature). So we can understand that the subjects and curriculum in Turkey are more focused on subjects such as Turkish language, Turkish Literature, Mathematics, Physics, Turkish History, Chimestry, Biology, Geometry, Geography, English, Foreign Languages (German, French, Italian, Japanese, Arabic and Russian). At the end of high school, students take a finishing school examination for twelve years, then before continuing their studies at university, students must take

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

the OSS. Additionally, many schools in Turkey offer vocational courses. Turkey's higher education system has seen rapid progress.

In addition to developing the primary school curriculum, Turkey's Ministry of National Education also develops and approves textbooks and teaching aids. Before the reforms, subjects included arts and crafts, citizenship and human rights, career guidance, foreign languages (English, French, or fourth-grade German), mathematics, music, physical education, religious and ethical education, natural sciences, social sciences, Turkish history, Turkish language and literature, and road safety and medical care. Prior to the education reform carried out in 1997, students attended five years of primary education and three years of secondary education. This structure is similar to the new 4+4 structure. Students who graduate from high school receive the Ortaokui Bitirme Diploma, which means Completion of the High School Diploma. Prior to 2012, students could begin advanced studies after graduating from eight years of primary school at the age of 14. With the new structure, students enter secondary school after four years in primary school and four years in secondary school. High school in both neighborhoods lasts for four years (grades 9 to 12). Prior to the 2005-2006 school year, high school lasted for three years (grades 9 to 11). Students can continue high school to a public, technical, or vocational high school. There are some high schools that offer an additional year of foreign language training.

Each curriculum is based on the intermediate school year, as shown in the table below. Some of the materials fall into two categories: materials for employees who are less confident in their jobs and materials for employees who are more confident. Students typically spend thirty minutes in class each day without any specific purpose. For travel, they are required to provide thirty credit cards each year.

Gambar 1. General Curriculum of High Schools in Turkey

Course	Grade 9	Grade 10	Grade 11	Grade 12
Language and Expression	2	2	2	2
Turkish Literature	3	3	3	3
Religion and Ethics	1	1	1	1
History	-	-	-	-
History of Turkish Revolution and kemalism	2	2	2	2
Geography	2	=	-	-
Matematics	4	-	-	-
Geometry	2	-	=	-
Physics	2	-	=	-
Chimestry	2	-	-	-
Bologi	2	-	-	-
Health	1	-	-	-
Philosophy	-	-	2	-
Foreign Language	3	2	2	2
Physical Education	2	2	2	2
Visual Arts/ Music	1	1	1	1
National security	-	1	-	-
Traffic and First Aid	-	-	-	-
Total	29	16	15	12

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

The objectives of Turkish education are contained in the National Education Constitution Number 1739 which include (1) Creating individuals who are committed to improving Turkish cultural and national values and understand the importance of responsibility; (2) Forming healthy and moderate people, respecting human rights, broad-minded, and responsible to society; and (3) Shaping people to practice profitable professions and contribute through their knowledge, skills, and attitudes.

#### Differences in Education Systems in Turkey and Germany

Factors that affect the development of education, both internal and external, are closely related. Ideology is one component that may have a significant impact on changes in the education system. According to Lin-Huber (1998), ideology plays an important role in determining a person's attitude towards a cultural system. The values embraced show this belief. These values are considered guidelines for interacting and behaving with others. Besides ideology, there are many other factors that influence education policy. So that it has a greater impact on the management of the education system and the quality of teachers. as stated by Fakry Gaffar, former president of the Conference of the Asian Comparative Education Association (CESA), during the declaration of CESSIA at the State University of Jakarta in February 2009.

Education in Germany and Turkey has many major differences. The following are some of the key differences: Turkish Education Structure: Basic education lasts for 8 years, starting from the age of 6 to 14 years. Secondary education lasts for 4 years, starting from the age of 14 to 18 years. Higher education: In Turkey, higher education includes bachelor's, master's, and doctoral programs. A bachelor's degree usually lasts for 4 years, a master's degree lasts for 2 years, and a doctorate takes longer to obtain. On the other hand, primary education in Germany lasts for 4 years, or 6 to 10 years. Secondary education lasts for 5 years, or 10 to 15 years. Higher education in Germany includes bachelor's, master's, and doctoral programs. Bachelor's degrees typically last 3-4 years, master's degrees 1-2 years, and doctoral degrees take longer. The differences between the curriculum and subjects in Turkish and German schools are as follows: In Turkey, the curriculum focuses more on subjects such as German, mathematics, science, and foreign languages; vocational education is also popular in Turkey, with many schools offering vocational programs. The main focus of education in Turkey is to develop students' skills and knowledge in various fields, such as management, finance, and marketing. Education in Germany also aims to prepare students to become successful leaders and entrepreneurs in the future.

#### **CONCLUSION**

A comparison of the education systems in Germany and Turkey shows fundamental differences in structure, curriculum, and teaching approaches, reflecting the education policies of each country. The German education system is known for its dual approach that integrates academic education and vocational training, while the Turkish education system emphasizes more on nationally standardized formal education. Ideology, as one of the important factors, has a great influence in shaping education policy, especially in determining the values that want to be instilled through the curriculum. In Germany, cultural diversity and the needs of the labor market encourage flexibility in the education system, while in Turkey, religious and nationalist factors are often the basis for shaping education policy. In addition to ideology, there are various other variables that also affect the education system, such as socio-economic conditions, urbanization levels, and the

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

availability of human resources. These factors play an important role in determining the management of the education system, the quality of teaching, and the accessibility of education in both countries. For example, Germany has a higher education system that includes bachelor's, master's, and doctoral programs with a focus on research and specialization. In contrast, in Turkey, primary and secondary education is a top priority to increase student participation, although it still faces challenges in equitable access across the region. While there are many differences, these two education systems offer advantages that are appropriate to the cultural, social, and economic context of each country. This comparative study provides insight into how education policies can be adapted to the needs of society and global challenges, while opening up opportunities for mutual learning to improve the overall quality of education.

#### REFERENCES

- Aksoy, Erdem. "2023 Vision for Education in Turkey in the Shadow of 1968 Curriculum." *Educational Studies* 50, no. 4 (3 Juli 2024): 480–98. https://doi.org/10.1080/03055698.2021.1956087.
- Almalky, Hussain A, dan Abdullah A Alwahbi. "Teachers' perceptions of their experience with inclusive education practices in Saudi Arabia." *Research in Developmental Disabilities* 140 (2023): 104584. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ridd.2023.104584.
- Ammar, Mohammad, Noora J Al-Thani, dan Zubair Ahmad. "Role of pedagogical approaches in fostering innovation among K-12 students in STEM education." *Social Sciences & Humanities Open* 9 (2024): 100839. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2024.100839.
- Anderson, Gary, Kathryn Herr, dan Ann Nihlen. "Studying Your Own School: An Educator's Guide to Practitioner Action Research." *Studying Your Own School: An Educator's Guide to Practitioner Action Research*, 2021, 26–28. https://doi.org/10.4135/9781483329574.
- Attema, Arthur E, Matteo M Galizzi, Mona Groß, Heike Hennig-Schmidt, Yassin Karay, Olivier L'Haridon, dan Daniel Wiesen. "The formation of physician altruism." *Journal of Health Economics* 87 (2023): 102716. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhealeco.2022.102716.
- Aunurrahman, Aunurrahman. "Implementation of Character Education in Building School Culture." *Jurnal Visi Ilmu Pendidikan* 13, no. 1 (2021): 11. https://doi.org/10.26418/jvip.v13i1.44565.
- Aziz, Azlisham Abdul. "Analysis Of Literature Review On Spiritual Concepts According To The Perspectives Of The Al-Quran, Hadith And Islamic Scholars." *Turkish Journal of Computer and Mathematics Education (TURCOMAT)* 12, no. 9 (2021): 3152–59.
- Barb, Amandine. "The new politics of religious education in the United States and Germany." *German Law Journal* 20, no. 7 (2019): 1035–46. https://doi.org/10.1017/glj.2019.73.
- Brundrett, Mark, Gary Beauchamp, Paul Latham, Malini Mistry, Michelle Murray, Becky Taylor, dan Peter Wood. *Contemporary Issues in Primary Education*. Vol. 1010. London: Routledge, 2022.
- Deissinger, Thomas, dan Philipp Gonon. "The Development and Cultural Foundations of Dual Apprenticeships a Comparison of Germany and Switzerland." *Journal of Vocational Education & Training* 73, no. 2 (3 April 2021): 197–216. https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2020.1863451.
- Demir, Sebnem Manolya, Feyza G Sahinyazan, Bahar Y Kara, dan Elfe Buluc. "No Country for Young Refugees: Barriers and Opportunities for Inclusive Refugee Education Practices." *Production*

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

- *and Operations Management*, 16 April 2024, 10591478241243382. https://doi.org/10.1177/10591478241243382.
- Firdaus, Muhammad Mirza. "Challenges and Opportunities of Higher Education Based on Islamic Boarding Schools." Dalam *Indonesian Proceedings and Annual Conference of Islamic Education (IPACIE)*, 1:437–44, 2022.
- Fuadi, Nazid Zaki, dan Muhammad Wildan Shohib. "The Teaching of Islamic Education in the Multicultural School Environment: Approaches and Challenges." *Jurnal PAI Raden Fatah* 6, no. 1 (2024): 76–88. https://doi.org/10.19109/pairf.v6i1.19822.
- Hanushek, Eric A., Guido Schwerdt, Ludger Woessmann, dan Lei Zhang. "General education, vocational education, and labor-market outcomes over the lifecycle." *Journal of human resources* 52, no. 1 (2017): 48–87. https://jhr.uwpress.org/content/52/1/48.short.
- Heyneman, Stephen P. "Comparative and international education in my experience: 1970–2022." *International Journal of Educational Development* 103 (2023): 102912. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2023.102912.
- Jonasson, Haukur Ingi, dan Helgi Thor Ingason. "Using altruism in project management education: How 'Doing Good' impacts student motivation." *Project Leadership and Society* 3 (2022): 100038. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.plas.2021.100038.
- Malla, Hamlan Andi Baso, Yusuf Arif Hidayat, Ardillah Abu, dan M Makbul. "The Application of Multicultural Education Values in Islamic Religious Learning at Karuna High School DIPA Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia." *International Journal of Social Science and Human Research* 5, no. 06 (2022): 2309–15.
- Muhaemin, Muhaemin, Rusdiansyah Rusdiansyah, Mustaqim Pabbajah, dan Hasbi Hasbi. "Religious moderation in Islamic religious education as a response to intolerance attitudes in Indonesian educational institutions." *Journal of Social Studies Education Research* 14, no. 2 (2023): 253–74.
- Muttaqin, Imron. "Brand Personality Dimension for Islamic Educational Institution." *Indonesian Journal of Islamic Education Studies (IJIES)* 6, no. 1 (2023): 33–49. https://doi.org/10.33367/ijies.v6i1.3757.
- Najah, Ainin, Imam Syafe'i, dan Amiruddin Amiruddin. "Implications of Learning in Islamic Religious Education in Forming Students' Attitudes of Religious Tolerance." *Al-Fikru: Jurnal Ilmiah* 16, no. 2 (2022): 306–13. https://doi.org/10.51672/alfikru.v16i2.136.
- Nugroho, Agung Pambudi, Riva Nanda Iksan, Tahta Alfina Fitria, dan Zulfia Syahrial Anne. "Renewable energy education and awareness among Indonesian students: Exploring challenges and opportunities for a sustainable future." *Sustainable Energy Technologies and Assessments* 63 (2024): 103631. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seta.2024.103631.
- Padil, Moh, Fatimah Saguni, dan Adawiyah Adawiyah. "Islamic Education Teachers Strategy in Implementing Multiculturalism Based Education." *International Journal of Contemporary Islamic Education* 3, no. 2 (2021): 78–94. https://doi.org/10.24239/ijcied.Vol3.Iss2.40.
- Sasmita, Reni. "Character Education Metod From the Lens of Al-Ghazali on Generation Z." *EDUSOSHUM: Journal of Islamic Education and Social Humanities* 2, no. 3 (2022): 121–30. https://doi.org/10.52366/edusoshum.v2i3.47.
- Schweitzer, Friedrich. "Comparative research in religious education: International-interdenominational-interreligious." *Towards a European perspective on religious education*, 2004.

Comparative Studies: Education Systems in Germany and Turkey Rosyidah AN et. al.

- Shaheen, Robina. "Creativity and Education." *Creative Education* 01 (Januari 2010): 166–69. https://doi.org/10.4236/ce.2010.13026.
- Souza, Alex Sander Clemente de, dan Luciana Debs. "Concepts, innovative technologies, learning approaches and trend topics in education 4.0: A scoping literature review." *Social Sciences & Humanities Open* 9 (2024): 100902. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2024.100902.
- Spulber, Diana, dan Marja Nesterova. "Intercultural Education and Social Innovation Approaches as Answers to Societal Challenges of Migration." *Geopolitical, Social Security and Freedom Journal* 6, no. 1–2 (1 Desember 2023): 20–37. https://doi.org/10.2478/gssfj-2023-0002.
- Suherman, Suherman. "Character education in the family as a strengthening of moderation during the pandemic era." *Journal of Social Studies (JSS)* 18, no. 2 (2022): 237–48. https://doi.org/10.21831/jss.v18i2.53229.
- Suhra, Sarifa, S Samsinar, Sarifa Halijah, dan Sarifa Nursabaha. "The Urgency of Cooperative Learning in the Implementation of the 2013 Curriculum on Islamic Religious Education Subjects at SMA Negeri 1 Watampone." *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology* 18, no. 10 (2021): 36–45.
- Susanty, Adriani, Nur Laili Indasari, Herawati Oktavianty, Ibnu Imam Al Ayyubi, Dwi Amalia Purnamasari, Elda Yulia Ryandini, Hafidz Abdullah, Titik Inayati, Muhamad Ahsan, dan Dwi Vernanda. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Malang: CV. Future Science, 2023.
- Yıldız, Ahmet. "Examining gifted primary school students' logical reasoning ability." *Turkish Journal of Educational Studies* 9, no. 1 (2022): 85–100. https://doi.org/10.33907/turkjes.892597.